

2022-2023 Student Learning Outcome Report

REVIEW

Tillamook Bay Community College (TBCC) has worked consistently on Student Learning Outcome Assessment. In 2013, when TBCC achieved its own independent NWCCU accreditation, and split from Portland Community College, faculty wrote new Course Content and Outline Guides (CCOG) and ensured all courses had Course Learning Outcomes (CLO). Relevant Program Learning Outcomes (PLO) and Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILO) are also included. Over the next few years faculty measured these outcomes on paper forms and engaged in the work of mapping all outcomes to ensure that all students could achieve all outcomes when their program is completed at TBCC. Additional work includes each CTE advisory board reviewing learning outcomes, key assignments developed and tied to course learning outcomes, program review which is well underway (measures all student learning outcomes and sets program goals), and the identification of barrier courses (defined as courses with the highest D, F and/or Withdraw rates) which have goals set for improvement. **This is now the FOURTH annual SLO report and it continues to improve.**

Updates

In the past year, 2022-2023, TBCC has continued to work on assessment. A more simplified outcomes tracking process has been developed in Moodle (which is a tool faculty already use). After each course all faculty, regardless of modality or location, measure all student learning outcomes including course learning outcomes, program learning outcomes and institutional learning outcomes directly in Moodle. This information is then exported and ties to a table in Jenzabar which allows us to analyze all SLO achievement by student demographics including gender, race, ethnicity, first-time status, age, and degree program (virtually any demographic factor that we store in Jenzabar). The narrative piece is also still completed in Moodle (as a quiz) and rolled into Jenzabar where faculty can pull it the next time the course is taught (and the Online Instructional Coordinator can pull and send to each faculty the next time they teach the course ensuring that the loop is closed on course improvement). While the process is still a bit “clunky” this is a serious improvement, and we are getting far more detailed and relevant information.

2022-2023

For the 2022-2023 academic year 86% of all student learning outcomes (Course Learning Outcomes, Program Learning Outcomes, and Institutional Learning Outcomes) were measured directly by faculty. This is up from 22% (16-17), 22% (17-18), 77% (in 18-19), 93% (in 19-20), 96% (in 20-21), but down from 98% (21-22); a gain of 64% overall and 12% less than last year. Despite the notable decrease from the previous year, we believe that our completion goal was met, and we will now focus on maintaining this impressive progress.

Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILO)

- Highest level aspirations, what students should exhibit at the end of their time at TBCC
- Align to values and core themes
- Measured: (a) end of every course; (b) program review; and via (c) Graduation Survey (new)

Program Learning Outcomes (PLO)

- What students should achieve as a result of completing their program
- Measured: (a) end of every course; (b) program review; and via (c) Graduation Survey (new)

Course Learning Outcomes (CLO)

- What a student should achieve at the completion of their course
- Measured: (a) end of every course; (b) course evaluation survey

As mentioned above, PLO's and ILO's are measured both directly and indirectly. In the past year rubrics to measure ILO and PLO achievement have been refined and all faculty, each term, are trained consistently on the use of these tools. We continue to ask students to complete a graduation survey and CTE employers to measure student PLO/ILO achievement in their capstone work experience course. We will continue to refine these with rubrics for consistent measurements. All of these efforts lead us to believe that our standardization is continuing to improve. PLO's are reviewed in detail every three years in the Program Review and adjusted through that process as data indicates.

CLO's are also measured both indirectly and directly. Faculty measure student success of course learning outcomes based upon performance on selected assignments in each course (direct measurement), and this rolls up into a compilation score in the assessment database (an indirect measure). We are making progress on standardized assignments to measure CLO's and we continue to work on this. Feedback is also gathered from students on course evaluation forms after each course which faculty then review and use for improvement. Faculty also set goals for improvement in each course, each time it is taught. This data is used the next time taught so faculty can prep the course with the previously set goals forefront in their minds. These actions serve to close the loop and re-start the ongoing cycle of improvement.

Overview of Total Achievement of Student Learning Outcomes (including transfer programs):

Note: For all, achievement is designed as competent and above.

	2017-2018	2018-2019	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023
Course Learning Outcomes	77%	63%	80%	74%	75%	79%
Program Learning Outcomes	75%	60%	80%	75%	72%	76%
Institutional Learning Outcomes	76%	58%	82%	71%	73%	75%

General Education Results;

	2017-2018	2018-2019	2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023
Course Learning Outcomes	77%	63%	80%	72%	72%	76%
Program Learning Outcomes	75%	60%	80%	72%	67%	71%
Institutional Learning Outcomes	76%	58%	82%	68%	73%	70%
ARTS & LETTERS						
CLO			74.62%	73%	77%	76%
PLO			70.34%	69%	79%	72%
ILO			74.55%	70%	75%	74%
READING & WRITING						
CLO			62.22%	63%	54%	59%
PLO			60%	70%	25%	44%
ILO			61.11%	41%	52%	42%
WRITING						
CLO			49.31%	71%	71%	74%
PLO			53.64%	74%	73%	71%
ILO			54.81%	71%	70%	72%

MATH							
	CLO			79.74%	65%	64%	69%
	PLO			76.99%	71%	68%	74%
	ILO			73.35%	61%	65%	70%
SCIENCE							
	CLO			61.35%	62%	62%	75%
	PLO			52.87%	65%	50%	70%
	ILO			55.03%	62%	52%	72%
SOCIAL SCIENCE							
	CLO			75.99%	80%	79%	77%
	PLO			67.23%	70%	70%	60%
	ILO			64.81%	73%	76%	67%
NAT/FOR/AG							
	CLO						90%
	PLO						78%
	ILO						63%
	HE/PE						
	CLO						93%
	PLO						100%
	ILO						91%

Career Technical Education;

		2019-2020	2020-2021	2021-2022	2022-2023
Course					83%
Program					81%
Institutional					82%
MIT					
	CLO	81%	87%	88%	94%
	PLO	78%	90%	89%	93%
	ILO	72%	88%	89%	95%
CRIMINAL JUSTICE					
	CLO	73%	84%	95%	60%
	PLO	76%	83%	88%	57%
	ILO	74%	81%	97%	60%
WELDING					
	CLO	81%	78%	74%	82%
	PLO	78%	84%	50%	73%
	ILO	72%	80%	54%	79%
BUSINESS					
	CLO	83%	82%	82%	84%
	PLO	77%	78%	80%	83%
	ILO	77%	78%	79%	83%
HEALTHCARE					
	CLO	80%	85%	84%	77%
	PLO	98%	79%	79%	79%
	ILO	84%	81%	88%	71%

By Student Demographics:

Average Achievement of outcomes for students...	CLO	PLO	ILO
Over 30 years of age	2.99	2.89	2.97
Under 30 years of age	3.14	3.18	3.10
Who identify as American Indian/Alaskan Native	3.34	3.5	3.31
Who identify as Asian	3.46	3.41	3.51
Who identify as Black or African American	2.79	3.03	2.74
Who identify as Hawaiian/Pacific Islander	3.55	3.52	3.44
Who identify as White	3.01	2.95	2.99
Who identify as LatinX	2.90	2.85	2.89
Who identify as male	3.01	2.95	2.99
Who identify as female	3.02	2.98	3.03
Who identify as other than male or female	3.57	3.51	3.58
Grand Average	3.16	3.16	3.14

22-23 Student Demographics

Average Achievement of outcomes for students...	CLO	PLO	ILO
30 years of age and older	3.22	2.95	3.22
Under 30 years of age	3.03	2.95	2.89
Who identify as American Indian/Alaskan Native	2.98	2.87	2.84
Who identify as Asian	3.54	3.26	3.30
Who identify as Black or African American	2.67	0.5	2.00
Who identify as Hawaiian/Pacific Islander	3.52	3.63	3.29
Who identify as White	3.15	3.07	3.04
Who identify as LatinX	2.85	2.80	2.80
Who identify as male	3.04	2.97	2.96
Who identify as female	3.10	3.02	3.00
Who identify as other than male or female	3.03	2.88	2.60
Grand Average	3.10	2.81	2.90

In general, student learning outcome success improved this year. Despite the ongoing impact on our students by COVID, it appears that each new cycle of our assessment practices is revealing increases in most areas. We did note, however a marked decrease from the previous year to this year in our Welding area. We are attempting to pinpoint a specific reason or set of reasons for this, and so far can surmise that in the past year the College was faced with the departure of the CTE Dean, the hiring of a new CTE Dean and subsequent departure of that individual. All of this during the implementation of the new organizational structure of the College. It is conceivable that these aforementioned events may have

SOCIAL SCIENCE						
CLO			75.99%	80%	79%	
PLO			67.23%	70%	70%	
ILO			64.81%	73%	76%	

Also worth mentioning again is that our size is a disadvantage for data analysis. Population numbers for some (e.g. Asian, Black, Pacific Islander students and students that identify as other than male/female) are *extremely* small and occasionally even 1-3 students. So, this data is not reliable for determining trends.

Still, it provides information for discussion and is valuable to examine. We can triangulate this information with retention, completion, and disproportionate enrollment data (which does support these findings).

Other Measurements:

Starting in 2019-2020 a graduation survey that measures institutional learning from the student perspective was added to the graduation application process. In 2019-2020 34% (14 of 44) of our graduates completed this survey. In 2020-2021 72% of our graduates completed the survey (34 of 47), 52% completed it (29 of 55) for 2021-2022, and for 2022-2023 25% completed it (14 of 57).

Of those graduates who responded, 94% stated “very much so” in response to the question, “Too what extent did you achieve your goal at TBCC?” The remaining 6% responded “somewhat”.

Results for Institutional Learning Outcomes are as follows;

To what degree did you achieve the following during your time here at Tillamook Bay Community College?	Emerging (defined with examples)	Developing (defined with examples)	Competent (defined with examples)	Advanced (defined with examples)
ILO 1: Students will engage in and take responsibility for intentional learning, seek new knowledge and skills to guide independent development, and adapt to new situations.	20: 7% (1) 21: 3% (1) 22: 0 23:	20: 0 21: 12% (4) 22: 3% (1) 23:	20: 43% (6) 21: 48% (16) 22: 61% (19) 23:	20: 50% (7) 21: 36% (12) 22: 35% (11) 23:
ILO 2: Students will effectively communicate, in writing, thoughts in a clear, well-organized manner to persuade, inform and/or convey ideas	20: 0 21: 3% (1) 22: 0 23:	20: 14% (2) 21: 24% (8) 22: 10% (3) 23:	20: 43% (6) 21: 30% (10) 22: 48% (15) 23:	20: 43% (6) 21: 42% (14) 22: 42% (13) 23:
ILO 2: Students will effectively orally communicate thoughts in a clear, well-organized manner to persuade, inform and/or convey ideas.	20: 0 21: 0 22: 0 23:	20: 0 21: 15% (5) 22: 13% (4) 23:	20: 79% (11) 21: 60% (20) 22: 58% (18) 23:	20: 21% (3) 21: 24% (8) 22: 29% (9) 23:
ILO 3: Students will critically analyze and solve problems, differentiating facts from opinions, by using informed judgement based on evidence, sound reasoning, and/or creativity in a variety of situations and areas of study.	20: 0 21: 6% (2) 22: 0 23:	20: 0 21: 9% (3) 22: 6% (2) 23:	20: 50% (7) 21: 33% (11) 22: 68% (21) 23:	20: 50% (7) 21: 52% (17) 22: 26% (8) 23:
ILO 4: Student will demonstrate respect, honesty, and ethical principles by understanding and appreciating differences in cultures and behaviors.	20: 0 21: 0 22: 0 23:	20: 0 21: 9% (3) 22: 3% (1) 23:	20: 21% (3) 21: 33% (11) 22: 42% (13) 23:	20: 79% (11) 21: 58% (19) 22: 55% (17) 23:

It was interesting to see that students agree that writing saw improvement as it was an area we have been working on. Work is still being done to further writing across the institution, so we look forward to continued improvements in this area. Most areas remained consistent, though ethical principles and intentional learning/taking responsibility for own learning seems to have dropped a bit (ILO 1 and 4).

Last year we piloted a survey of our employers and asked them to rate our CTE students in their final capstone course (work experience). Though small, these results are promising. We will continue building this out by requiring it as part of the student CWE and add a training component (rubric) for standardization. It was valuable to see what employer (third party) reviewers thought of our student performance at the conclusion of their programs. For this past year, this survey was not completed due to a number of reasons, including the absence of numerous administrative personnel as a result of resignations and ensuing challenges for filling those vacancies; the departure of the Vice President of Instruction and Student Services and the process for hiring our new VPI and onboarding them after the end of the school year; and the need for many of our current administrative and exempt personnel to take on additional duties and responsibilities to ensure the fluid operation of the college in the absence of several key personnel. The new VPI, Dean of General Education and Transfer, and the Dean of Student Success and Partnerships intend to complete this survey during Fall term of this 2023-2024 year to maintain the continuity of data collection from graduates. The following table shows the results from the previous year. We expect these numbers to trend higher for 2021-2022 and continue to increase for the 2022-2023 year.

Employer Survey Results

INSTITUTIONAL LEARNING	UNSAT	MARGINAL	AVE	PROFICIENT	OUTSTAND
Takes responsibility for learning new things on the job (ILO 1)				33%	66%
Seeks out new knowledge (ILO 1)				33%	66%
Adapts to new situations (ILO 1)				66%	33%
Effectively communicates orally ideas and thoughts in an organized manner to persuade inform or convey ideas (ILO 2, GE- Oral Communication)			33%	66%	
Effectively communicates written ideas and thoughts in an organized manner to persuade inform or convey ideas (ILO 2, GE- Written Communication)			33%	66%	
Can critically analyze and solve problems (ILO 3, GE- Math)			33%	66%	
Differentiates fact from opinion (ILO 3)				100%	
Uses informed judgement based on evidence and sound reasoning (ILO 3)				100%	
Demonstrates respect, honesty, fairness and ethical principles by appreciating differences in cultures and behaviors (ILO 4)			33%	33%	33%
Use appropriate mathematics to solve problems- recognizes which concepts are needed for a scenario, applies, and correctly solves (GE- Computation)			33%	66%	
Accurately interprets, validates and communicates responses (GE- computation)			33%	66%	

Demonstrates effective social skills and understands human behavior (GE- Human Relations)			33%	66%	
Applies knowledge and experience to foster personal growth and appreciate the social world (GE- Human Relations)			33%	33%	33%
Builds and manages relationships (GE- Communication)			33%	66%	

Manufacturing Specific Program Outcomes

PLO	UNSAT	MARGINAL	AVE	PROFICIENT	OUTSTAND
Demonstrate the technical knowledge and skills necessary for industrial/manufacturing systems			100%		
Communicate effectively, both orally and in writing, using language appropriate to industrial and manufacturing environments.			100%		
Perform troubleshooting/problem solving processes as applied to industrial situations.			100%		
Apply correct mathematical and scientific principles necessary to a mechanized production environment.			100%		
Employ the principles of the customer-business relationship within a manufacturing environment.			100%		

Business Specific Program Outcomes

PLO	UNSAT	MARGINAL	AVE	PROFICIENT	OUTSTAND
Social Skills: Works effectively and ethically within a diverse business team				50%	50%
Info Literacy Skills: Use computer applications for managerial analysis, presentations and reports					100%
Thinking Skills: Apply analytical and critical thinking to evaluate information, solve problems and make decisions					100%
Communication Skills: Communicate effectively, appropriately, and professionally to internal and external stakeholders					100%

Implications

We believe that the results from this annual outcomes assessment exercise should translate into measureable actions, in terms of instruction and learning. Therefore, this year's outcomes will be

reviewed in collaboration with instructors, Deans, and the Vice-President of Instruction and Student Services, with the intention of identifying potential areas of opportunity where instruction and learning experiences can be improved or strengthened during the next academic year. The objective is to develop measurable items that will reflect whether instruction and/or learning has improved as a result of the implementation of said items. The results of this review will be included in the annual outcomes assessment report for the 2023-2024 year.

General Observations:

The past year (2022-2023) can be characterized as both challenging and productive. TBCC continues to face the challenges brought about by COVID. There have been yet again multiple cases of positions being vacated, which have required the necessary transition periods for each new colleague to be brought onboard and learn their respective roles within the TBCC work environment. In some cases, this is still ongoing. Despite these challenges, we have found that our students continue to achieve the learning outcomes at respectable rates, with upward tendencies in most cases.

For the upcoming 2023-2024, the two ILO's that shall serve as our themes for the year. ILO 1: Students will engage in and take responsibility for intentional learning, seek new knowledge and skills to guide independent development, and adapt to new situations. ILO 2: Students will effectively communicate, in writing and orally, thoughts in a clear, well-organized manner to persuade, inform and/or convey ideas.

Goals: 2023-2024:

1. We will develop rubrics for student employers to use in the CWE capstone courses and train them on its use.
2. We will have 100% employer completion of the survey.
3. We will seek the successful transition of the outcomes assessment process to the Canvas LMS.
4. We will continue the development and refinement of direct measures of Program Level Outcomes where appropriate.

Overall, we are pleased with the progress made over the past year and look forward to further improvement as we strive to achieve these goals in the next year.